All That Glitters May Not Be Gold
Assessing Latin America’s Recent Macroeconomic Performance

XLIX Annual Meeting of the Board of Governors of the IADB - April 4, 2008
Research Department
Inter-American Development Bank
I. Current Perceptions on Macroeconomic Performance in LAC: “This Time Is Different”

II. Beyond Perceptions:
   All that Glitters May Not Be Gold

III. Is the Current Subprime Crisis a Measure of the Region’s Strength?

IV. Taking Advantage of the Current Bonanza: A Tentative Set of Policy Topics for Discussion
I. Current Perceptions on Macroeconomic Performance in LAC: “This Time Is Different”

II. Beyond Perceptions:
   All that Glitters May Not Be Gold

III. Is the Current Subprime Crisis a Measure of the Region’s Strength?

IV. Taking Advantage of the Current Bonanza: A Tentative Set of Policy Topics for Discussion
Latin America Recent Macroeconomic Performance

**Economic Activity**
(LAC-7, GDP Annual Growth)

- **90s Boom**
  - 1991: 5%
  - 1993: 4%
  - 1995: 4%
  - 1997: 6%
  - 1999: 3%

- **Russian Crisis**
  - 2001: 0%

- **Current Boom**
  - 2003: 7%
  - 2005: 6%
  - 2007: 5%

- **Average 91-97**: 4.6%
- **Average 94-97**: 5.8%

**Inflation**
(LAC-7 median, CPI Annual Variation)

- **Average 91**: 0%
- **Average 93**: 5%
- **Average 95**: 10%
- **Average 97**: 15%
- **Average 99**: 20%
- **Average 01**: 25%
- **Average 03**: 30%
- **Average 05**: 35%
- **Average 07**: 40%

- **Average 03-07**: 4.9%

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.
**Latin America Recent Macroeconomic Performance**

### Fiscal Balance
(LAC-7, % of GDP)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1991</th>
<th>1993</th>
<th>1995</th>
<th>1997</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.5%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Public Debt*
(LAC-7, % of GDP)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1991</th>
<th>1993</th>
<th>1995</th>
<th>1997</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.5%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Debt Composition
(LAC-7, Foreign Currency Debt, % of Total Debt)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1991</th>
<th>1993</th>
<th>1995</th>
<th>1997</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>63%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

*Adjusted by Argentina’s debt exchange.
Latin America Recent Macroeconomic Performance

**Current Account**
(LAC-7, Billions of US Dollars and % of GDP)

**International Reserves***
(LAC-7, Billions of US Dollars)

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

*LAC-7 is computed as the sum of Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela.
Latin America Recent Macroeconomic Performance

Credit Ratings*
(Latin America)

Numerical Transformation of Credit Ratings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BBB+</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BB+</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BB-</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B+</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCC+</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCC</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCC-</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Latin American countries included in the EMBI Index with data availability since 1997. Average of numerical scale transformation of S&P credit ratings; see Powell and Martínez (2008).
The “This Time is Different” View

• Exceptional macroeconomic outcomes and strong fundamentals:
  – Place the region in a privileged position to engage in sustained growth
  – Make the region less vulnerable to adverse changes in external conditions

• Recent turmoil in US financial markets was met with a relatively subdued reaction in LAC-7 bond markets, an apparently powerful testimony to the region’s new-found strength
I. Current Perceptions on Macroeconomic Performance in LAC: “This Time Is Different”

II. Beyond Perceptions: All that Glitters May Not Be Gold

III. Is the Current Subprime Crisis a Measure of the Region’s Strength?

IV. Taking Advantage of the Current Bonanza: A Tentative Set of Policy Topics for Discussion
External Conditions for Latin America

**World Production**
(World-7 GDP Index, Annual Variation, Weighted by PPP adjusted GDP*)

**Commodity Prices**
(Index of Oil and Non-Oil Commodities, Oct-02=100)

**External Financial Conditions**
(EMBI spread, basis points)

---

*World-7 includes G-3 (EU-15, Japan and USA) and EM-4 (China, India, Korea and Russia)
Growth Performance in Latin America

GDP Forecast Conditional on External Variables*
(LAC-7, values expressed in logs)

Growth in Emerging Markets: A comparative Perspective
(Real GDP, 2003 – 2007 Annual Growth)

- Emerging Asia
- Ex USSR
- Middle East
- Emerging Europe
- Africa
- Latin America

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

*Izquierdo, Romero and Talvi (2007)
Observed and Structural Fiscal Balances*  
(Structural balances computed by applying the “Chilean Fiscal Rule” to other LAC-7 countries)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Chile (LAC-7, % of GDP)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>-4.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>-4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>-2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

Fiscal balances include: Public Sector (Mexico), Non-Financial Public Sector (Argentina, Colombia, Peru), General Government (Brazil), Central Government (Chile, Venezuela).

*Izquierdo, Ottonello and Talvi (forthcoming).
## Fiscal Balances by Country

(Dec-06, in % of GDP)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Observed Fiscal Balance</th>
<th>Structural Fiscal Balance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Traditional HP Filter*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Argentina</strong></td>
<td>1.8%</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Brazil</strong></td>
<td>-3.0%</td>
<td>-3.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Colombia</strong></td>
<td>-0.5%</td>
<td>-1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mexico</strong></td>
<td>0.1%</td>
<td>-0.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peru</strong></td>
<td>2.1%</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Venezuela</strong></td>
<td>-0.2%</td>
<td>-2.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LAC-6</strong></td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>-1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chile</strong></td>
<td>7.7%</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LAC-7</strong></td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LAC-6 is the simple average of Argentina, Brazil, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

Fiscal balances include: Public Sector (Mexico), Non-Financial Public Sector (Argentina, Colombia, Peru), General Government (Brazil), Central Government (Chile, Venezuela).

*HP = Hodrick Prescott; lambda = 1600 (quarterly data).

**Izquierdo, Ottonello and Talvi (forthcoming).
Fiscal Revenues and Expenditures*
(Adjusted revenues computed by applying the “Chilean Fiscal Rule” to other LAC-7 countries)

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

Fiscal balances include: Public Sector (Mexico), Non-Financial Public Sector (Argentina, Colombia, Peru), General Government (Brazil), Central Government (Chile, Venezuela).

*Izquierdo, Ottonello and Talvi (forthcoming).
Public Expenditure Composition in Latin America

Public Investment Expenditure
(LAC-7, in % of Primary Expenditure)

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.
Observed and Structural Public Debt*  
(LAC-7, in % of GDP)

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

*Izquierdo, Ottonello and Talvi (forthcoming).
Debt Riskiness: “The Mutation Factor”

Debt Riskiness
(LAC-7, Risky Debt in % of Total Domestic Debt*)

Debt Riskiness: Two Revealing Examples
(Risky Debt in % of Total Domestic Debt**)

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

*Risky debt includes foreign-currency debt, short-term debt and variable interest rate debt. LAC-7 excludes Peru.

**For Mexico, risky debt is computed by taking the ratio of Tesobonos (denominated in US dollars) to total domestic public debt. The latter includes Cetes, Bondes Ajusta Bonos and Tesobonos. For Brazil, risky debt is constructed by taking the ratio of the sum of domestic public debt indexed to the Selic plus exchange-rate-indexed debt over total domestic public debt.
Liquidity Risk Ratios: “The Mutation Factor”

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

*LInternational reserves net of Central Bank short-term liabilities.

Liquidity Risk Ratios
(LAC-7, ratio of external public debt amortizations in the next 12 months to international reserves*)

Liquidity Risk Ratios: Two Revealing Examples
(LAC-7, ratio of external public debt amortizations in the next 12 months to international reserves*)
Latin America’s External Position*

Observed and Adjusted Current Account
(LAC-7, Billions of US Dollars** and % of GDP)

Capital Flows
(LAC-7, Billions of US Dollars**)

LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

* Calvo and Talvi (2007).

**LAC-7 is computed as the sum of Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela.
LAC-7 is the simple average of the seven major Latin American countries, namely Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela. These countries represent 91% of Latin America’s GDP.

EA-5 is the simple average of Indonesia, Korea, Malaysia, Philippines and Thailand.
Taking Stock

• Removing the veil of external bonanza uncovers vulnerabilities in performance and fundamentals that are not immediately apparent

• Although credit ratings have improved dramatically since 2003, they are not higher than prior to the Russian crisis as they should be expected to be if in spite of apparently higher fundamental
Taking Stock

- None of the vulnerabilities above is in and of itself a destabilizing factor...
- ...but when put together, they call for a reevaluation of the region’s stance
- This does not lessen relevant progress in macroeconomic management made by the region
- It is precisely because these achievements need to be sustained that this reevaluation is necessary
I. Current Perceptions on Macroeconomic Performance in LAC: “This Time Is Different”

II. Beyond Perceptions: All that Glitters May Not Be Gold

III. Is the Current Subprime Crisis a Measure of the Region’s Strength?

IV. Taking Advantage of the Current Bonanza: A Tentative Set of Policy Topics for Discussion
Emerging Markets’ Reaction to US Subprime Crisis

Bond Prices by Region
(US High Yield, Latin EMBI, Asia EMBI and Europe EMBI, Bond Price Equivalent, 23-Jul-07 = 100)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Variation (23 Jul-18 Feb)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>US High Yield</td>
<td>-10.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emerging Europe</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Emerging Markets' Reaction to US Subprime Crisis
Emerging Markets’ Reaction to US Subprime Crisis

Bond Prices in Emerging Countries with Strong, Mixed and Weak Fundamentals*
(US High Yield and EMBI Bond Price Equivalent, 23-Jul-07 = 100)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fundamentals</th>
<th>Variation (23 Jul-19 Feb)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>US High Yield</td>
<td>-10.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weak Fundamentals</td>
<td>0.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Fundamentals</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strong Fundamentals</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* A country with strong fundamentals is defined as a country that displays both a current account and a fiscal surplus; a country with weak fundamentals is a country that displays both a current account and a fiscal deficit; and a country with mixed fundamentals is a country that has a surplus in one dimension and a deficit in the other.
Reasons for Financial Decoupling Now (but not Then)

- The source of the crisis: Subprime turmoil detonated at the center
- This prompted massive intervention by the Federal Reserve, helping isolate the crisis and prevent contagion into other asset markets
- This decoupling stands in stark contrast with the behavior of the 1998 financial crisis, which detonated in the periphery
- Liquidity provision by the Fed was not nearly as aggressive, as US financial markets remained largely unscathed
OUTLINE

I. Current Perceptions on Macroeconomic Performance in LAC: “This Time Is Different”

II. Beyond Perceptions: All that Glitters May Not Be Gold

III. Is the Current Subprime Crisis a Measure of the Region’s Strength?

IV. Taking Advantage of the Current Bonanza: A Tentative Set of Policy Topics for Discussion
Taking Advantage of the Bonanza: Policy Topics

Resist the temptation of taking comfort in favorable tailwinds, and work towards:

• Strengthening fiscal policy
  - Adopting structural fiscal rules consistent with the reduction of structural debt-to-GDP ratios to prudent levels

• Strengthening regulation and supervision
  - Ensuring adequate shares of investment in primary expenditure
  - Enforcing capital ratios and provisions that are pro-cyclical
  - In fast credit growth sectors, ensuring that competition does not weaken the risk management process
Taking Advantage of the Bonanza: Policy Topics

- Generating a genuine build-up of international reserves
  - Ensuring that financing for reserve accumulation does not weaken their insurance value
- Creating conditions conducive to long-lasting growth
  - Using favorable times to foster a business climate that stimulates private investment and productivity growth
THANK YOU